COLORADO SUPREME COURT CASE ANNOUNCEMENTS TUESDAY, MAY 27, 2025

"Slip opinions" are the opinions delivered by the Supreme Court Justices and are subject to modification, rehearing, withdrawal, or clerical corrections. Modifications to previously posted opinions will be linked to the case number in the petition for rehearing section the day the changes are announced. Click on the public domain citation to view the opinion in pdf format.

OPINIONS

<u>2025 CO 24</u>

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC784 Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA137

Petitioner:

Ryan Wallace Bonde,

v.

Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Judgment Affirmed en banc

CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE GABRIEL, JUSTICE HART, JUSTICE SAMOUR, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined.

<u>2025 CO 25</u>

Supreme Court Case No. 24SA244 Interlocutory Appeal from the District Court Arapahoe County District Court Case No. 22CR505 Honorable David N. Karpel, Judge

Plaintiff-Appellant:

The People of the State of Colorado,

v.

Defendant-Appellee:

Oscar Jonas Ganaway.

Order Reversed

en banc

JUSTICE BOATRIGHT delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE HART, and JUSTICE SAMOUR joined. JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER, joined by JUSTICE GABRIEL, dissented.

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC583 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 20CA1678

Petitioner:

Zachary Eugene Babcock,

v.

Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Judgment Affirmed en banc

JUSTICE HOOD delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HART, JUSTICE SAMOUR, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined. JUSTICE GABRIEL, joined by CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, concurred in the judgment.

<u>2025 CO 27</u>

Supreme Court Case No. 24SA184 Appeal from the District Court District Court, City and County of Denver, Case No. 22CV32480 Honorable Christopher J. Baumann, Judge

Plaintiffs-Appellants:

American Heritage Railways, Inc. and The Durango & Silverton Narrow Gauge Railroad Company,

v.

Defendant-Appellee:

Colorado Public Utilities Commission,

and

Intervenor-Appellee:

La Plata County, Colorado.

Judgment Affirmed

en banc

JUSTICE GABRIEL delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE HART, JUSTICE SAMOUR, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined.

Supreme Court Case No. 24SC539 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA1316

Petitioners:

The People of the State of Colorado,

In the Interest of Minor Child: B.C.B.;

and

B.C.B.,

v.

Respondents:

A.B. and J.S.

Judgment Reversed en banc

JUSTICE GABRIEL delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE HART, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined. CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, joined by JUSTICE SAMOUR, dissented.

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC525 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA669

Petitioner/Cross-Respondent:

Darryl Cornelious Johnson,

v.

Respondent/Cross-Petitioner:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Judgment Affirmed en banc

JUSTICE HART delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE SAMOUR, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined. JUSTICE GABRIEL, joined by CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, concurred in the judgment.

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC622 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA1713

Petitioner:

The People of the State of Colorado,

v.

Respondent:

Jessica Jo Roberson.

Judgment Reversed en banc

JUSTICE HART delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE SAMOUR, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined. JUSTICE GABRIEL, joined by CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, concurred in the judgment.

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC168 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 20CA646

Petitioner:

Audrey Lee Tennyson,

v.

Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Judgment Affirmed en banc

JUSTICE SAMOUR delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE HART, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined. JUSTICE GABRIEL dissented.

Supreme Court Case No. 23SC775 *Certiorari to the Colorado Court of Appeals* Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA2074

Petitioner:

Shaun Jeff Snow,

v.

Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Judgment Reversed

en banc

JUSTICE SAMOUR delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE GABRIEL, JUSTICE HART, and JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER joined.

<u>2025 CO 33</u>

Supreme Court Case No. 24SA109 Appeal from the District Court District Court, Water Division 1, Case No. 19CW3236 Honorable Todd L. Taylor, Water Judge

Concerning the Application for Water Rights of Town of Firestone.

Applicant-Appellant:

Town of Firestone,

v.

Opposers-Appellees:

BCL Colorado LP; City and County of Broomfield; City of Boulder; City of Englewood; City of Lafayette; City of Longmont; City of Westminster; Dream Weaver Holdings LLC; Godding Ditch Company; Last Chance Ditch Company; LG Everist, Inc.; Little Thompson Water District; New Coal Ridge Ditch Company; New Consolidated Lower Boulder Reservoir and Ditch Company; Public Service Company of Colorado; Rural Ditch Company; Shores On Plum Creek Metropolitan District No. 1; St. Vrain Left Hand Water Conservation District; St. Vrain Sanitation District; State Engineer and Water Division 1 Engineer; Town of Frederick; Varra Companies, Inc.; and Water Users Association of District No. 6.

> Orders Affirmed en banc

JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER delivered the Opinion of the Court, in which CHIEF JUSTICE MÁRQUEZ, JUSTICE HOOD, JUSTICE HART, and JUSTICE SAMOUR joined. JUSTICE GABRIEL, joined by JUSTICE BOATRIGHT, dissented.

PETITION FOR REHEARING

2025 CO 18

Supreme Court Case No. 24SA258 Original Proceeding Pursuant to C.A.R. 21 El Paso County District Court Case No. 24CR1183 Honorable Marcus S. Henson, Judge

In Re Plaintiff:

The People of the State of Colorado,

v.

Defendant:

Patrick L. Beverly, II.

Petition for Rehearing DENIED. EN BANC. **JUSTICE BOATRIGHT** and **JUSTICE BERKENKOTTER** would grant the petition.

ORIGINAL PROCEEDING

25SA44 In Re O'Hanlon, Kenneth v Hutchinson, Edson Order issued May 23,2025

DENIED PETITIONS FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI

No. 24SC397, Court of Appeals Case No. 22CA14 Petitioner: Brendan Joseph Shannon, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC647, Court of Appeals Case Nos. 23CA191 & 23CA659 Petitioner: Ivy Ngo, v. Respondents: Franklin D. Azar & Associates P.C., a Colorado Corporation and Franklin D. Azar.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC702, Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA1656

Petitioner: Sean Daevon Brogan, v.

Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC. JUSTICE HOOD does not participate.

No. 24SC765, Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA1229 Petitioners:

ELM Law LLC and Eric Martinson,

v.

Respondents:

Veronica Ortiz Garcia and Rigoberto Garcia Morales.

No. 24SC789, Court of Appeals Case No. 22CA534 Petitioner: Reynold Ramcharan, v. Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

JUSTICE HOOD and JUSTICE SAMOUR would grant as to the following issue:

Whether the court of appeals erred by creating a requirement, not contained in the rape shield statute, that an offer of proof submitted with a rape shield motion must contain facts establishing the *admissibility* of the proffered evidence in order to obtain a hearing on the admissibility of the evidence.

No. 24SC791, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA230 Petitioners:

Murphy Creek Development, Inc., a Colorado corporation and Murphy Creek LLC, a Wyoming limited liability company,

v. **Respondent:**

Brian K. Matise.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC792, Court of Appeals Case No. 22CA51 Petitioner: Rodger Dean Goodall, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC803, Court of Appeals Case No. 21CA2042 Petitioner: Antoinette Michelle Grubb, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

No. 24SC811, Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA748 Petitioner: Zachary Caine Rhodes, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC816, Larimer County District Court Case No. 24CV30106 Petitioner: Kevin Crew, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 24SC818, Court of Appeals Case No. 22CA1017 Petitioner: Jacob R. Ibarra, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC2, Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA483 Petitioner: Emelio J. Vasquez, v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado.

No. 25SC30, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1419

In the Matter of

Preston A. Vickers Irrevocable Trust,

Petitioner:

Alan Preston Vickers,

v.

Respondents:

Gary Vickers, Greg Vickers, and Nancy Vickers Berman.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC107, Court of Appeals Case No. 22CA1588 Petitioner: Noe Maniz, v. Respondent:

The People of the State of Colorado.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC109, Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA1291

In re the Marriage of **Petitioner:** Deborah Lizarraga n/k/a Deborah Leimomi Byrne, and **Respondent:** Manuel Q. Lizarraga.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC208, Court of Appeals Case No. 23CA27 Petitioner: F.J., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Child: A.A., and Concerning B.H.

No. 25SC216, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1832 Petitioner: K.V-D., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Child: B.W.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC219, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA483 Petitioner: M.M., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Children: J.M., M.V., M.M., and P.M.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC222, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1378 Petitioner: H.LC., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Child: M.C.

No. 25SC223, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1402 Petitioner: C.H., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Children: Iza.H. and Izr.H., and Concerning K.A.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC232, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1968 Petitioner: K.D., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Children: A.D., E.D., T.D., and S.D.

Petition for Writ of Certiorari DENIED. EN BANC.

No. 25SC236, Court of Appeals Case No. 24CA1188 Petitioners: J.M. and J.P.T., v. Respondent: The People of the State of Colorado, In the Interest of Minor Child: S.T.